# Examining How Voice Teachers Influence Student Achievement

Heather Fletcher, Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson



Heather Fletcher



Amanda E. Krause



Jane W. Davidson

Journal of Singing, March/April 2023 Volume 79, No. 4, pp. 445–456 https://doi.org/10.53830/HHJH1114 Copyright © 2023 National Association of Teachers of Singing

#### INTRODUCTION

Substitution of the success of the expert voice teacher predominantly have focused on the attributes, behaviors, and practices of classical voice teachers,<sup>1</sup> but seldom have associations been made between voice teacher expertise and the success of their students. This is important to consider, as the quality of a voice teacher is believed to be proven by the quality of the students they produce.<sup>2</sup> The present study examines different attributes and characteristics of expert voice teachers specifically background and experience, as well as psychological components, including empathy and leadership—in order to determine precisely what influences student success. The majority of existing studies defining the qualities of expert voice teachers are exclusive to the classical music genre only,<sup>3</sup> even though research indicates a greater demand for contemporary styles of singing in music tuition.<sup>4</sup> Thus, this study investigates classical and music theater voice teachers as the overlap in their pedagogic roots makes them optimal for comparative analysis.<sup>5</sup>

Expert voice teachers are characterized by having extensive teaching and performing experience.<sup>6</sup> Training strongly influences the voice teacher's practices as they replicate pedagogic concepts, such as technical exercises, learned during their own experiences as voice students.<sup>7</sup> Further, experts hone skills through teaching a variety of students over a number of years,<sup>8</sup> as well as through first-hand knowledge and experience in the professional performing arts industry.<sup>9</sup> Adapting teaching practices to facilitate the individual needs of singing students is another characteristic of the expert voice teacher.<sup>10</sup> However, while little is said about how teachers actually determine the individual needs of their singing students, psychological aspects of the voice teacher's approach are said to facilitate the individual singer's development. Cognitive, social, physiological, and developmental psychology are considered central to voice pedagogy.<sup>11</sup> For example, voice teachers need to be able to diagnose vocal problems,<sup>12</sup> find solutions sensitively and ethically,<sup>13</sup> and navigate psycho-emotional issues that can impinge upon a singer's development.<sup>14</sup> Thus, effective communication is a fundamental concern of voice pedagogy as talking openly while establishing trust is vital to student success.<sup>15</sup> The way in which voice teachers communicate has the power to not only facilitate student learning, but to compel behavior.<sup>16</sup>

Accordingly, the psychological aspects of voice teacher practices resemble empathy, the ability to understand and adopt another's perspective,<sup>17</sup> and transformational leadership, the ability to motivate others and facilitate their individual interests.<sup>18</sup> Investigating empathy and leadership in voice teachers could offer greater understanding as to how they target individual student needs.

# **Empathy in Teachers**

Teacher empathy is considered to be one of the most important emotional characteristics of teachers, particularly in that it facilitates promoting a positive learning environment, inclusivity, and both trust and comfort.<sup>19</sup> Earning trust allows the teacher to better cater to the student's intellectual and social needs in learning.<sup>20</sup> Thus, teacher empathy is a professional asset,<sup>21</sup> as it is likely to improve teacher effectiveness.<sup>22</sup> The results of empathic teaching impacts student development, student learning and engagement, student achievement, and student well-being.<sup>23</sup> For example, in investigating the influence empathy has on student motivation and achievement, Cooper notes that empathy developed over time through intimate, frequent interactions facilitates "personal, social, moral and academic development" in learning environments. Further, empathy generates positive emotions and enriches a sense of self in the students.<sup>24</sup>

Voice teachers need empathy in order to train their students for the physical and psychological rigors of performing.<sup>25</sup> Empathetic voice teacher practices include responding to an individual student's development with appropriate knowledge of acoustics and physiology,<sup>26</sup> understanding as to how the student feels when they sing,<sup>27</sup> and perspective-taking in order to establish a warm and encouraging learning environment.<sup>28</sup> Helding recommends that voice teachers utilize empathy to ensure students they care about them, as "much of [voice teachers'] success hinges on our ability to empathize with students, and the degree to which our students believe we care about them is directly proportional to how well they will follow our recommendations for the tools of success, like regular practice and physical exercise."29 Callaghan notes that many Australian voice teachers spoke of a need for empathy in their teaching practices.<sup>30</sup> However, while it is evident that teacher empathy is good for developing relationships, and that empathy in

voice teachers is essential to their pedagogy, no research to date concludes how empathetic teaching practices account for student success, nor the influence that voice teacher empathy has on student learning outcomes.

# Transformational Leadership in Teachers

Bass's theoretical framework defines transformational leaders as motivational role models, intellectually stimulating followers by catering to their self-interests on an individual level and supporting them in pursuit of an inspiring goal/vision.<sup>31</sup> In education research, transformational teaching affects student motivation through inspiration and enthusiasm, thus greatly impacting student academic performance.<sup>32</sup> It also supports and enhances student learning and is a predictor of student learning outcomes.<sup>33</sup> For example, Pounder's comprehensive review of transformational leadership outcomes in a classroom context indicates that it "stimulates academic motivation, engagement and effort, fosters students' intentions to engage in instructional activities in their own time, engenders student self-efficacy and facilitates cognitive and affecting learning."34

Bass also identifies charisma as a part of his transformational leader framework. Charisma is characterized as the manner in which a leader acts as a role model, generating pride, confidence, and loyalty through concern and consideration of the follower's needs.<sup>35</sup> Some studies of leadership in education and music refer to charisma as a behavioral aspect of transformational leadership, specifically with regard to idealized influence.36 For example, Waters-Bailey identified charisma as an "emotional" element of transformational leaders through their demonstration of high moral and ethical standards.<sup>37</sup> The majority of research on transformational leadership in music targets conductors for whom charisma is considered the most important aspect of transformational leadership.<sup>38</sup> This is because charismatic conductors communicate their vision of the orchestra, stress the intrinsic value of the musician's efforts and goal accomplishments, and increase individual and collective self-efficacy.<sup>39</sup> However, while the merits of leadership in music and education are evident, there is a dearth of knowledge as to how teacher leadership influences student outcomes specifically in individual singing tuition.

#### AIMS

The present study investigated associations between classical and music theater voice teachers' empathy, leadership, training, and experience, and their students' performing achievements. In particular, it aimed to consider the proportion in variance in student performing achievement that can be accounted for by psychological variables (e.g., teacher empathy and leadership) and by voice teacher experience (e.g., number of years teaching and number of students) and achievement (e.g., performing and teaching). This study also aimed to determine if the teachers' instruction genre (e.g., classical, music theater, both) influenced student performing achievement.

#### METHOD

#### Participants

In total, 147 teachers completed the survey, 84% of whom (N=123) resided in Australia. As systematic approaches to singing teaching are unique to different locations and cultures,<sup>40</sup> participants who resided outside Australia (N=24) were excluded from the current data analyses in order to target a particular, representative cohort. Of the 123 Australian voice teacher participants, there were 95 females (77%), 27 males (22%), and one nonbinary participant (1%). Participant ages ranged from 26-78 years old (M = 48.23, Mdn = 47.50, SD = 12.09). There were 23 classical (18%) teachers, 32 music theater (26%) teachers, 61 teachers (50%) who identified as teaching both classical and music theater, and seven teachers (6%) who did not indicate their teaching genre. Participants had between 1-50 years of teaching experience (M = 20.23, Mdn = 19.00, SD = 11.34).

The Human Research Ethics Committee at The University of Melbourne approved this research (ID: 1750622.1). Recruitment included purposively sampling voice teachers between July-December 2018. Recruitment methods included approaching individual Australian voice teachers directly via email, distributing the survey to members of the Australian National Association of Teachers of Singing and the Australian Voice Association also via email, and two digital newsletters (that of a voice journal and the Association of Music Educators Incorporated). Additionally, snowball sampling was used such that participants were asked to share the research opportunity with their colleagues.

#### Materials

This study used an online quantitative survey distributed by Qualtrics, an online platform for conducting survey research. The first part of the survey included two standardized measures: the Empathy Components Survey<sup>41</sup> and the Leadership Scale for Sports.<sup>42</sup> A Qualtrics function randomized the order in which the two measures appeared, as well as the order of the questions in the measures themselves, to mitigate order effects. In the second part, participants were asked to respond to a series of questions concerning themselves, as well as their teaching, performing, and students.

The Empathy Components Questionnaire. Participant empathy was measured using the Empathy Components Questionnaire (ECQ).<sup>43</sup> The ECQ was chosen because it clearly defines the multidimensional construct of empathy, reflects current theories of empathy, is derived from seven well validated and often used empathy surveys, and uses positively and negatively worded questions in order to deter social desirability bias.44 It is a self-report, 30-item scale (e.g., "I do well at noticing when one of my friends is uncomfortable"; "I take an interest in looking at both sides to every argument"; "When I do things, I like to take others' feelings into account"). Participants were asked to respond using a four-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (disagree strongly) to 4 (agree strongly). A composite "empathy" score was computed for participants by calculating a mean score of their responses to the 30 items of the ECQ, such that demonstrating higher levels of empathy is indicated by a higher score.

*The Leadership Scale for Sports.*<sup>45</sup> As no existing measure of leadership in voice teaching was available, an established measure from the sports domain was used, as singers have been compared to athletes and their teachers to coaches (and both spend many hours training and preparing for competitions and performances).<sup>46</sup> Thus, the Leadership Scale for Sports (LSS) was selected because it is a popular survey for measuring the leadership behaviors of coaches,<sup>47</sup> is "applicable to a variety of leadership roles (e.g., coach, athletes, military),"<sup>48</sup> and recent research employing this measure supports modifying the measure to suit research aims.<sup>49</sup> The LSS is a

		Fac	ctors	
Survey Item	1 <sup>a</sup>	2 <sup>b</sup>	3°	<b>4</b> <sup>d</sup>
I give specific instructions to each student as to what he/she should do in every situation.	0.715			
I pay special attention to correcting students' mistakes.	0.709			
I explain to every student what he/she should and should not do.	0.670			
I figure ahead on what should be done.	0.491			
I explain how a student's contribution fits into the whole picture.	0.323			
I help the students with their personal problems.		0.782		
I encourage the student to confide in me.		0.631		
I help students settle their conflicts.		0.470		
I look out for the personal welfare of the students.		0.454		
I see to it that our efforts are coordinated.			1.011	
I specify in detail what is expected of each student.			0.529	
I expect every student to carry out his/her assignment to the last detail.			0.401	
I see to it that every student is working to his/her capacity.			0.380	
I express appreciation when a student performs well.				0.645
I give credit when credit is due.				0.589
I tell a student when he/she does a particularly good job.				0.541
Eigenvalue	5.038	2.476	1.834	1.580
% Variance Explained	20.151	9.905	7.337	6.318
Cronbach's alpha	.692	.730	.694	.562

TABLE 1	. Promax Rotated	Factor Structure	of the Amended	Leadership Scale.
---------	------------------	------------------	----------------	-------------------

*Note.* <sup>a</sup> = "Instruction"; <sup>b</sup> = "Social Support"; <sup>c</sup> = "Training Facilitation"; <sup>d</sup> = "Positive Feedback." Factor loadings < .300 have been suppressed.

self-report measure consisting of 40 items divided into five subscales: Training and Instruction, Democratic Behavior, Autocratic Behavior, Social Support, and Positive Feedback. In the present study, the 25 questions pertaining to the Training and Instruction (12 items), Social Support (eight items), and Positive Feedback (five items), subscales were used (because the Democratic and Autocratic subscales appeared to relate more to group learning rather than to the one to one learning environment of the voice lesson, they were excluded). Training and Instruction items explore how the coach's behavior and training improves the athlete's performance, Social Support refers to how the coach's behavior focuses on the athlete's personal needs, and Positive Feedback as how the coach rewards athletes for their performance.<sup>50</sup>

The LSS language was modified so that "athlete" was replaced with "student," and "his" was replaced with "his/her." For example, "I see to it that every athlete is working to his capacity," was modified to read "I see to it that every *student* is working to *his/her* capacity." Additionally, the item "Make sure that his part in the team is understood by all the athletes" was removed, as it was considered irrelevant to the one to one aspect of vocal tuition. All of the measure items can be found in Table 1. Participants were asked to indicate their response on a five-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (*never*) to 5 (*always*).

In the present study, the structure of the 25 LSS items was examined through principal axis factor analysis with promax rotation. Four factors accounting for 43.711% of the variance were identified as underlying the 25 survey items (see Table 1). The four factors reflected the categorization of the three LSS sub-scales: specifically, factor 1 reflected Instruction, factor 2 reflected Social Support, factor 3 reflected Training Facilitation, and factor 4 reflected Positive Feedback. Thus, an Instruction, Social Support, Training Facilitation, and Positive Feedback score was computed for each participant by averaging their responses to the items that loaded onto these four factors. These scores were used in subsequent analyses.

Demographics and Teaching/Performing Experience. Participants were asked to state their gender, age, nationality, country of residence, and to indicate their teaching genre (classical, music theater, or both). Questions were constructed from previous research to ascertain teacher expertise by addressing performing achievement, teaching experience, pedagogic training and ongoing development, and student achievement.<sup>51</sup> Participants were asked to indicate their highest performing achievements from the following nine items: Won an international competition; Won a national competition; Employed at a major opera house; Employed at a B-grade opera house; Toured commercially with a major musical; Performed in high-level commercial theater (e.g., Broadway, West End, etc.); Signed with a performing agency; Been professionally recorded; Graduated university with honors (see Endnote). A total "teacher performing achievement score" was created for subsequent analyses by summing the total number of items a participant ticked. For this score, responses were equally weighted such that the higher the number of performing achievements the participant ticked, the higher the total score (ranging from 0–9).

Two questions were designed based on previous research recognizing voice teacher experience through conducting master classes and adjudicating competitions.<sup>52</sup> Specifically, participants were asked to indicate whether they had run master classes/workshops (yes/no) and adjudicated competitions/eisteddfods (yes/no). A total "teacher teaching achievements score" was created for subsequent analysis by summing the positive responses to these two questions (0–2). These responses were equally weighted. Participants were also asked to estimate how many students they have taught specifically at the tertiary level and to indicate how many years they had been teaching.

Lastly, participants were asked to indicate their students' highest performing achievements by ticking any that applied from the same list used to indicate teacher achievement: Won an international competition; Won a national competition; Employed at a major opera house; Employed at a B-grade opera house; Toured commercially with a major musical; Performed in high level commercial theater (e.g., Broadway, West End, etc.); Signed with a performing agency; Been professionally recorded; Graduated university with honors. A total "student achievement score" was created for subsequent analyses, determined by the number of achievements the participant ticked. Thus, the variable for student performing achievements comprised of nine equally weighted items, ranging from 0–9, such that a higher score indicated greater student achievement.

#### Procedure

Individuals accessed the survey via a direct web link to the plain language statement. Once participants indicated consent, they completed the survey as a series of webpages. Participation was estimated to take no more than 20 minutes. Upon completion, participants were redirected to a debriefing statement and were asked to share the survey link with anyone they thought would be interested in participating.

# RESULTS

All quantitative data were analyzed using SPSS software (version V26). Table 2 outlines the sample's characteristics.

# Student Achievement and Teacher Empathy and Leadership

To estimate the proportion in variance in student achievement that can be accounted for by psychological variables (i.e., teacher empathy, instruction, social support, training facilitation, and positive feedback), a standard multiple regression analysis was performed. In combination, leadership and empathy accounted for 13% of the variability in student achievement, adjusted  $R^2 = .08$ , F(5, 104) = 3.10, p = .012;  $f^2 = .15$ . As seen in Table 3, facilitated training and giving positive feedback were significantly, positively associated with a greater number of student performing achievements.

# Student Achievement and Teacher Experience and Achievement

A second standard multiple regression analysis estimated the proportion in variance in student achievement accounted for by voice teacher experience (i.e., number

TABLE 2. Sample Characteristics.	Sample Chi	aracteristics.									
Sample		Age	Empathy	Instruction	Social Support	Training Facilitation	Positive Feedback	Teacher Teaching Achievements Score	Teacher Performing Achievements Score	Student Performing Achievements Score	
Classical <sup>a</sup>	M	51.86	3.31	3.93	3.02	4.22	4.84	1.61	3.09	3.30	
	Mdn	50.50	3.27	4.00	3.00	4.25	5.00	2.00	3.00	2.00	
	SD	12.07	0.20	0.56	0.69	0.57	0.36	0.72	1.50	2.88	
Music	M	43.91	3.34	3.64	3.17	4.08	4.80	1.38	2.78	3.16	
$Theater^{b}$	Mdn	45.00	3.40	3.70	3.25	4.25	5.00	1.50	2.00	3.00	
	SD	11.01	0.24	0.68	0.67	0.63	0.38	0.71	1.98	2.17	
Classical	M	49.08	3.33	3.89	3.11	4.23	4.81	1.43	3.07	3.92	
and Music	Mdn	50.00	3.67	4.00	3.25	4.25	5.00	2.00	3.00	4.00	
Theater <sup>c</sup>	SD	12.23	0.28	0.58	0.71	0.50	0.29	0.72	2.08	2.72	
<sup>a</sup> N = 23 (82.60% female, 17.40% male). <sup>b</sup> N = 32 (71.90% female, 28.10% male). <sup>c</sup> N = 61 (75.40% female, 23.00% male).	% female, 17 % female, 28 % female, 23	7.40% male). 3.10% male). .00% male).									

Heather Fletcher, Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson

of years teaching and number of students) and achievement (i.e., performing and teaching). In combination, teaching achievements and experience accounted for 59% of the variability in student achievement, adjusted  $R^2 = .58$ , F(4, 106) = 38.45, p < .001;  $f^2 = 1.45$ . As indicated in Table 4, student achievement was significantly, positively associated with teaching achievements (both performing and teaching) as well as with the number of students taught.

#### Student Achievement and Teaching Genre

A one-way between groups analysis of variance (ANOVA) examined how the teachers' instruction genre (i.e., classical, music theater, both) influenced the total student performing achievement score variable. The ANOVA was statistically nonsignificant, indicating that teaching genre was not associated with student achievement, F(2, 113) = 1.06, p = .351,  $\eta^2 = .02$ .

## DISCUSSION

This study investigated which characteristics and attributes of classical and music theater voice teachers were associated with the performing achievements of their students. A positive association existed between teacher empathy and student achievement (p = .060) which supports previously published research advocating the application of empathy in classroom teaching, teacher training, and, more specifically, in teaching singing.<sup>53</sup> Teacher empathy may also explain how voice teachers determine and meet the individual needs of their singing students, a noteworthy finding, since targeting student needs is considered to be a characteristic of expert voice teaching.<sup>54</sup>

Moreover, statistically significant associations existed between student achievement and two components of teacher leadership: training facilitation and positive feedback. As these results indicate, voice teachers of successful students work hand in hand with them, facilitating their learning by coordinating their efforts and ensuring the student is working to capacity. This supports research of one to one instrumental and vocal tuition with regard to facilitating student learning.<sup>55</sup> For example, music teachers create an autonomous learning environment by striving not to "bombard" or impose their own, vast knowledge base on the student.<sup>56</sup> The

TABLE 3. Unstandardized (B) and Standardized ( $\beta$ ) Regression Coefficients, and Squared Semi-Partial Correlations (sr<sup>2</sup>) for Each Predictor in a Regression Model Predicting How Teacher Empathy and Leadership Influences Student Achievement.

Variable	В	95% Cl	ß	sr <sup>2</sup>
Empathy	-2.064	[-0.09, 4.21]	-0.199	.03
Instruction	-0.462	[-1.39, 0.47]	-0.107	.01
Social support	-0.295	[-1.10, 0.51]	-0.077	.00
Training facilitation	-1.628**	[0.55, 2.70]	-0.344	.08
Positive feedback	-2.014*	[-3.92, -0.11]	-0.208	.04

*Note.* N = 110, CI = confidence interval.

 $^{*}p < .05, ^{**}p < .01.$ 

**TABLE 4.** Unstandardized (B) and Standardized ( $\beta$ ) Regression Coefficients, and Squared Semi-Partial Correlations (sr<sup>2</sup>) for Each Predictor in a Regression Model Predicting How Teacher Experience and Achievement Influence Student Achievement.

Variable	В	95% CI	ß	sr <sup>2</sup>
Teacher performing achievements	0.389***	[0.20, 0.58]	0.281	.07
Teacher teaching achievements	0.605*	[0.03, .1.19]	0.166	.02
Number of years teaching	0.030	[-0.03, 0.06]	0.131	.01
Number of students	0.839***	[0.54, 1.14]	0.433	.12

*Note.* N = 110, CI = confidence interval.

p < .05, p < .01, p < .01, p < .001.

current findings demonstrate that voice teachers do not seek to make students fully responsible for their own learning, but rather that see to it that students are carrying out their work to teacher specifications. These findings indicate that in order to produce more successful students, a well conceived and articulated vocal training process with positive feedback is the best pedagogy.

Expressing appreciation for a student's work and giving credit for a particularly good job was also associated with student success. These findings highlight a difference between vocal and instrumental tuition, as positive feedback is less prominent in research on one to one instrumental lessons. For example, Duke and Simmons specifically note that, among the piano, violin, and oboe teachers they observed, negative feedback was markedly more frequent and specific in addressing musical effects of student performance.<sup>57</sup> However, studies specific to voice teachers indicate that they should be encouraging in their approach,<sup>58</sup> which may be because voice teachers have to encourage students to communicate safely and collaboratively about their bodies and their largely invisible instrument.<sup>59</sup>

The present results also indicated that teacher background was significantly positively associated with the success of their students. Teachers with more successes in their performing careers had students with more performing successes in theirs. This finding supports previous assertions that exemplary voice teachers hail from professional performing backgrounds.<sup>60</sup> Teacher background with regard to teaching achievements was also significantly positively associated with student achievement, such that the more the teacher had achieved and participated in education processes such as adjudicating competitions, running master classes, and conducting workshops, the more their students were achieving in performance. This is different from attaining a pedagogy/performance degree or partaking in professional development. The finding suggests that students might proactively seek out the teaching services of those running the short courses and workshops, rather than attending them.

# Heather Fletcher, Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson

It is unsurprising that there was a positive association between the number of students a teacher has taught and resulting student achievement. It makes sense that the more students a teacher has, the more likely a successful student would exist among that cohort, as per Proctor who found that experts teach a variety of students over an extended period of time.<sup>61</sup> However, it is important to note the number of years a participant had been teaching was not a predictor of student achievement; thus, it was not the amount of time the teacher had been teaching, but rather the amount of students they had taught that best developed their pedagogic practice. As research shows, music teachers favor student-centered learning environments;<sup>83</sup> thus, it is possible that exposure to a higher number of students would influence a voice teacher's practices more than a learning environment that is teacher-centric. Additionally, whereas observing and analyzing best teaching practices may be the best preparation for one to one music teachers,<sup>63</sup> it is plausible that developing into a master teacher may occur through engaging with a higher volume of students. Therefore, the findings imply that a strong focus in voice teacher training should be to have prospective teachers work with numerous and diverse students earlier in their teaching career, as this will assist in developing a more student-centered approach.

Lastly, teaching genre did not influence student achievement, suggesting the genre in which teachers classify themselves does not impact on the performing achievements of their students (noting that half of our sample identified as teaching both classical and music theater). Thus, the distinct performing and teaching experiences of the teachers themselves are more important to student success than genre identification. This distinction is important, as exemplary singing teachers identified in academia almost always hail from a background in classical singing.<sup>64</sup> Current findings could encourage more diversity in the hiring practices of voice teachers in academia, particularly with a growing demand for contemporary styles of singing in music markets and instruction.<sup>65</sup> For example, instead of training classical voice teachers to teach belt, voice teachers who have themselves trained in contemporary methods and have performed in relevant industries could apply their own individual expertise and knowledge firsthand.

#### Limitations and Future Research

While this study focused on Australian voice teachers, future research should be conducted on an international scale. Such an effort would afford a larger sample with greater statistical power, and also allow for comparison of the trends noted among Australian teachers relative to teachers in different countries. Another limitation concerns the measurement of teacher and student achievement. The list of achievement criteria and how they were equally weighted may not have truly captured the entire essence of achievement in performance and pedagogy. Future qualitative investigations using face to face interviews or observations of teacher practices could validate these findings, generating a more in-depth understanding of the associations between voice teacher experience, background, engagement, and achievement. Further, as responses to this survey were self-report, observing teacher practices could provide rich data while minimizing potential bias. Future research should also consider how voice teachers train and achieve success in both their performing and teaching practices.

## CONCLUSION

The present findings indicate that successful voice teachers are successful performers who have both trained extensively as teachers (irrespective of musical genre) and worked with a larger number of students. Voice teachers with successful students clearly demonstrate leadership qualities through facilitating student training and providing positive feedback as well as empathy.

The twenty-first century voice teacher is urged to consider the "whole" student, <sup>66</sup> how they learn, and what motivates them. Given the findings of this study, empathy and leadership training is key to developing future voice teachers. Incorporating empathy and leadership training into voice pedagogy courses could contribute to quality voice teaching practices. Further, we can hypothesize that practicing teachers who continue to focus on their own professional development as performing artists can, in turn, positively influence their student development and success. Considering the benefits to singing students, more research is warranted to discover what on-going voice teacher training would be the most useful.

#### Endnote

Quantifiable and objective criteria to assess performing achievements of classical and music theater teachers/ students were generated based on previous literature concerning classical singers, specifically winning competitions, employment at an opera house, and performing to an international standard.<sup>67</sup> Some of these concepts are transferrable to music theater (i.e., opera house could equate to commercial theater). However, the following criteria were devised for music theater: 1) being professionally recorded, as "successful" American music theater was preserved through recordings, particularly cast recordings, which are of great financial investment;<sup>68</sup> 2) signing with an agent; and 3) graduating from a performing arts or music degree "with honors" (i.e., demonstrating achievement above an institution's criteria).

#### Acknowledgements

The authors express sincere gratitude to all who have participated in this research.

#### Funding

The first author disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the publication of this article: This work was supported by the Conservatorium of Music Director's Writing Up Grant (The University of Melbourne).

#### NOTES

- 1. Heather Fletcher, Jane W. Davidson, and Amanda E. Krause, "Defining the Expert Voice Teacher: A Narrative Review of the Literature," *Australian Voice* 21 (2020): 9–21.
- Philip A. Duey, Bel Canto in Its Golden Age: A Study of Its Teaching Concepts, (New York: Da Capo Press, 1980; reprint of 1951 edition published by King's Crown Press). Jenny Dufault, "Three Exemplary Voice Teachers: David Adams, Stephen King, and Patricia Misslin; Their Philosophies and Studio Techniques" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Minnesota, 2008); http://search.proquest.com/ docview/304531905/abstract/B872F477E2D94789PQ/1.
- Richard Kennell, "Systematic Research in Studio Instruction in Music," in *The New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 243–256; https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/ articulo?codigo=4409516. Elizabeth Kathryn Stanley, "The Nature of Applied Voice Teaching Expertise: Common Ele-

ments Observed in the Lessons of Three Exemplary Applied Voice Instructors" (D.M.A. document, Boston University, 2018); http://search.proquest.com/docview/2124999326/ abstract/E358FBB4F4EF4DDCPQ/1.

- 4. Jeannette LoVetri, "Who's Minding the Store?," Journal of Singing 59, no. 4 (March/April 2003): 345. Marisa Elizabeth Naismith, "A Class of Its Own: Towards a Pedagogical Framework for Singers of Contemporary Commercial Music (CCM)" (Ph.D. thesis, Queensland Conservatorium, QLD, Griffith University, 2019).
- Edrie Means Weekly and Jeannette L LoVetri, "Follow-Up Contemporary Commercial Music (CCM) Survey: Who's Teaching What in Nonclassical Music," *Journal of Voice* 23, no. 3 (May 2009): 367–375; https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jvoice.2007.10.012.
- Dufault. Susan Durham-Lozaw, "Toward a Music Theater Vocal Pedagogy for Emerging Adult Female Singers" (D.M.A. document, Boston University, 2014); http:// search.proquest.com/docview/1545660951/abstract/ 6AD0EA0EEC34D93PQ/1.
- 7. Helena Gaunt, "One-to-One Tuition in a Conservatoire: The Perceptions of Instrumental and Vocal Teachers," *Psychology of Music* 36, no. 2 (2008): 215–45; https://doi. org/10.1177/0305735607080827. Richard Kennell, "Systematic Research in Studio Instruction in Music," in *The New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 243–256; https:// dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=4409516.
- 8. Donald Frederick Proctor, *Breathing, Speech, and Song* (Wien: Springer, 1980).
- 9. Kennell.
- Elizabeth Louise Blades-Zeller, "Vocal Pedagogy in the United States: Interviews with Exemplary Teachers of Applied Voice" (D.M.A. document, University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, 1993); http://search.proquest.com/ docview/304066948/abstract/C623DE409F304E2FPQ/1. Dufault.
- Karen Sell, *The Disciplines of Vocal Pedagogy: Towards an Holistic Approach* (Hants, England: Ashgate, 2005). Laurie S. Shelton, "Vocal Problem or Body Block? A Look at the Psyche of the Singer," *Journal of Singing* 53, no. 5 (May/June 1997): 9–13, 16–18.
- 12. Dufault.
- 13. Sell.
- Clifton Ware, "High Note: The Singer as Psychologist," Opera Journal 35, no. 4 (December 2002): 10–32.
- 15. Dufault.

# Heather Fletcher, Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson

- Richard Kennell, "Teaching Music One-on-One: A Case Study," *Dialogue in Instrumental Music Education* 21, no. 1 (1997): 68–81.
- Laurie Batchelder, Mark Brosnan, and Chris Ashwin, "The Development and Validation of the Empathy Components Questionnaire (ECQ)," Alessio Avenanti, ed., *PLOS ONE* 12, no. 1 (January 2017): e0169185; https://doi.org/10.1371/ journal.pone.0169185.
- 18. Bernard M. Bass, *Leadership and Performance Beyond Expectations* (New York, NY: Free Press, 1985).
- Snežana Stojiljković, Gordana Djigić, and Blagica Zlatković, "Empathy and Teachers' Roles," *Procedia—Social and Behavioral Sciences* 69 (December 2012): 960–966; https://doi. org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.12.021. Gretchen McAllister and Jacqueline Jordan Irvine, "The Role of Empathy in Teaching Culturally Diverse Students: A Qualitative Study of Teachers' Beliefs," *Journal of Teacher Education* 53, no. 5 (November 2002): 433–443; https://doi.org/10.1177/002248702237397. Tracey Bennett Carter, "How Self-Awareness, Motivation, and Empathy Are Embedded and Modeled in Commu nity College Preservice Early Educator Online Courses" (Ph.D. dissertation, Walden University, 2017); http:// search.proquest.com/docview/1972007205/abstract/ F99C4FD01BE4900PQ/1.
- 20. Carter.
- 21. Tony Chiu Ming Lam, Klodiana Kolomitro, and Flanny C. Alamparambil, "Empathy Training: Methods, Evaluation Practices, and Validity," *Journal of MultiDisciplinary Evaluation* 7, no. 16 (2011): 162–200.
- 22. Chezare A. Warren, "Towards a Pedagogy for the Application of Empathy in Culturally Diverse Classrooms," *The Urban Review* 46, no. 3 (September 2014): 395–419; https://doi. org/10.1007/s11256-013-0262-5.
- Carl R. Rogers, Harold C. Lyon, and Reinhard Tausch, On Becoming an Effective Teacher: Person-Centered Teaching, Psychology, Philosophy, and Dialogues with Carl R. Rogers and Harold Lyon (London; New York: Routledge, 2014). Vishal Arghode, Bugrahan Yalvac, and Jeffrey Liew, "Teacher Empathy and Science Education: A Collective Case Study," Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education 9, no. 2 (December 2013): 89–99; https://doi. org/10.12973/eurasia.2013.921a. Norma Deitch Feshbach and Seymour Feshbach, "Empathy and Education," in The Social Neuroscience of Empathy (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2009). Izhak Berkovich, "Conceptualisations of Empathy in K-12 Teaching: A Review of Empirical Research," Educational Review (October 2018): 1–20; https://doi.org/10.1 080/00131911.2018.1530196.

- 24. Bridget Cooper, "Empathy, Interaction and Caring: Teachers' Roles in a Constrained Environment," *Pastoral Care in Education* 22, no. 3 (September 2004): 94; https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0264-3944.2004.00299.x.
- 25. Vaike Kiik-Salupere and Jaan Ross, "Tripartite Unity: What Students Expect from Their Teacher and Accompanist During Individual Singing Lessons," *TRAMES—A Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences* 15, no. 4 (2011): 404–421.
- 26. Scott McCoy, "Singing Pedagogy in the Twenty-First Century: A Look Toward the Future," in *Teaching Singing in the 21st Century* (Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands, 2014), 13–20; https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-8851-9\_2.
- 27. Oren Brown, "Sensations," *Journal of Singing* 58, no. 3 (January/February 2002): 229–232.
- 28. Pearl Shinn Wormhoudt, *With a Song in My Psyche: On the Psychology of Singing and Teaching Singing* (Philadelphia: Xlibris, 2001).
- 29. Lynn Helding, "Empathy and Loving-Kindness," *Journal of Singing* 73, no. 5 (May/June 2017): 547.
- Jean Callaghan, "The Relationship between Scientific Understandings of Voice and Current Practice in the Teaching of Singing in Australia" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Western Sydney, 1997); http://search.proquest.com/ docview/1947649491/abstract/DF7EA540F7BB440APQ/2.
- 31. Bass.
- 32. James S. Pounder, "Transformational Classroom Leadership: A Basis for Academic Staff Development," *Journal of Management Development* 28, no. 4 (April 2009): 317–325; https:// doi.org/10.1108/02621710910947353. Talat Islam et al., "The Impact of Transformational and Transactional Leadership Styles on the Motivation and Academic Performance of Students at University Level," *Journal of Educational and Social Research* 2, no. 2 (2012): 237–244.
- 33. Amarjit Gill et al., "Effects of Transformational Leadership on Student Educational Satisfaction and Student Stress," *The Open Education Journal* 3, no. 1 (March 2010): 1–9; https://doi.org/10.2174/1874920801003010001. Janelle L. Harrison, "Instructor Transformational Leadership and Student Outcomes," *Emerging Leadership Journeys* 4, no. 1 (2011): 91–119.
- James S. Pounder, "Quality Teaching through Transformational Classroom Leadership," *Quality Assurance in Education* 22, no. 3 (1 July 2014): 278; https://doi.org/10.1108/ QAE-12-2013-0048.
- 35. Bass.
- 36. Aaron Noland and Keith Richards, "The Relationship Among Transformational Teaching and Student Motivation and

#### Examining How Voice Teachers Influence Student Achievement

Learning," *The Journal of Effective Teaching* 14, no. 3 (2014): 5–20. Pounder.

- 37. Stacy Lynn Waters-Bailey, "Perceived Transformational Teacher Leadership and Students' Motivation, Academic Performance, and Intent to Persist in STEM Education at a Community College" (Ph.D. dissertation, Old Dominion University, 2016), 18; http://search.proquest.com/ docview/1873007525/abstract/9B895510C56B4B3FPQ/1.
- Susan Armstrong and Scott Armstrong, "The Conductor as Transformational Leader," *Music Educators Journal* 82, no. 6 (1996): 22–25; https://doi.org/10.2307/3398947. Yaakov Atik, "The Conductor and the Orchestra: Interactive Aspects of the Leadership Process," *Leadership & Organization Development Journal* 15, no. 1 (1994): 22–28; https://doi. org/10.1108/01437739410050123.
- Sabine Boerner and Diether Gebert, "Fostering Artistic Ensemble Performance: Exploring the Role of Transformational Leadership," *Nonprofit Management & Leadership* 22, no. 3 (2012): 347–365; https://doi.org/10.1002/nml.20058.
- 40. Graham F. Welch, "The Assessment of Singing," *Psychology of Music* 22, no. 1 (April 1994): 3–19; https://doi. org/10.1177/0305735694221001.
- 41. Batchelder, Brosnan, and Ashwin.
- 42. P. Chelladurai and S. D. Saleh, "Dimensions of Leader Behavior in Sports: Development of a Leadership Scale," *Journal of Sport Psychology*, no. 2 (1980): 34–45.
- 43. Batchelder, Brosnan, and Ashwin.
- 44. Ibid.
- 45. Chelladurai and Saleh.
- 46. Wendy DeLeo LeBorgne and Marci Daniels Rosenberg, *The Vocal Athlete* (San Diego, CA: Plural Publishing Inc, 2014). Sharon L. Radionoff, "Preparing the Singing Voice Specialist Revisited," *Journal of Voice* 18, no. 4 (December 2004): 513–521; https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvoice.2003.10.003. Carlyle E. Weiss, "The Vocal Athlete," *Music Teachers National Association* 27, no. 5 (May 1978): 32–33. Chelladurai and Saleh. Margaret S. Osborne, Don J. Greene, and Don T. Immel, "Managing Performance Anxiety and Improving Mental Skills in Conservatoire Students through Performance Psychology Training: A Pilot Study," *Psychology of Well-Being* 4, no. 1 (December 2014): 1–17; http://dx.doi. org.ezp.lib.unimelb.edu.au/10.1186/s13612-014-0018-3.
- Laura Chittle et al., "Investigating the Relationship between the Relative Age Effect and Leadership Behaviors among Male Ice Hockey Players," *International Review for the Sociol*ogy of Sport 52, no. 6 (September 2017): 751–768; https:// doi.org/10.1177/1012690215616271.

- Todd M. Loughead, "Athlete Leadership: A Review of the Theoretical, Measurement, and Empirical Literature," *Current Opinion in Psychology* 16 (August 2017): 59; https://doi. org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2017.04.014.
- 49. Chittle et al.
- 50. Chelladurai and Saleh.
- 51. Kennell, "Systematic Research in Studio Instruction in Music." Proctor. Helena Gaunt, "Student and Teacher Perceptions of One-to-One Instrumental and Vocal Tuition in a Conservatoire" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of London, University College London [United Kingdom], 2006); http://search.proquest.com/docview/2117492821/ FF94A0523D9F4149PQ/5. Dufault, "Three Exemplary Voice Teachers."
- Paul Atkinson, "The Mastersingers: Language and Practice in an Operatic Masterclass," *Ethnography and Education* 8, no. 3 (September 2013): 355–370; https://doi.org/10.1080 /17457823.2013.792673. Clifton Ware, "What's a Singing Competition All About?," *Journal of Singing* 54, no. 1 (September 1997): 3–6.
- Warren. Bobette Bouton, "Empathy Research and Teacher Preparation: Benefits and Obstacles," *SRATE Journal* 25, no. 2 (2016): 16–25. Scott McCoy, "Chess and the Art of Voice Pedagogy," *Journal of Singing* 71, no. 1 (September/October 2014): 47–50.
- 54. Blades-Zeller. Dufault. Stanley.
- Dufault, "Three Exemplary Voice Teachers." Jenny Dufault, "Practical Advice for the Voice Pedagogue," *Journal of Singing* 70, no. 1 (September/October 2013): 31–41.
- Dufault, "Practical Advice for the Voice Pedagogue," 38. Bethany Cencer, "The Music Teacher as Coach... Empowering Students to Realize Their Inner Potential," *The American Music Teacher* 57, no. 1 (September 2007): 31–33.
- 57. Robert Duke and A. L. Simmons, "The Nature of Expertise: Narrative Descriptions of 19 Common Elements Observed in the Lessons of Three Renowned Artist-Teachers," *Bulletin for the Council of Research in Music Education* 170 (2006): 7–19.
- 58. Scott D. Harrison, "Who Am I? Attributes of Singing Teachers," *Australian Voice* 9 (2003): 7–11.
- 59. Stanley.
- 60. Kennell, "Systematic Research in Studio Instruction in Music."
- 61. Proctor.
- 62. Meghan Bathgate, Judith Sims-Knight, and Christian Schunn, "Thoughts on Thinking: Engaging Novice Music Students in Metacognition," *Applied Cognitive Psychology* 26, no. 3 (2012): 403–409; https://doi.org/10.1002/acp.1842.

Setareh Beheshti, "Improving Studio Music Teaching through Understanding Learning Styles," *International Journal of Music Education* 27, no. 2 (May 2009): 107–115; https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761409102319.

- 63. Duke and Simmons.
- 64. Weekly and LoVetri.
- 65. Naismith.
- 66. Ivy Walz, "Training the 21st Century Voice Teacher: An Overview and Curriculum Survey of the Undergraduate Experience" (Ph.D. thesis, The University of Cincinnati, 2013), 9; http://search.proquest.com/docview/1871569126/ abstract/608263A36340460APQ/1.
- Dufault, "Three Exemplary Voice Teachers;" Megan C. Sage, "An Exploratory Study of Opera Singers' Professional Achievement from the Perspective of Grit," *Opera Journal; Canyon* 51, no. 1 (June 2018): 43–89. Sage.
- 68. Frank L. Warner, "Recorded Original Performances from the American Theatre Prior to 1943," *Educational Theatre Journal* 26, no. 1 (1974): 101–107.

**Dr. Heather Fletcher** is a lecturer and voice teacher at both the Melbourne Conservatorium of Music and Victorian College of the Arts at The University of Melbourne. Her PhD in music psychology focuses on the practices of expert classical and music theater voice teachers in Australia, while her other research interests include social psychology and how music making/listening impacts well-being in everyday life. As a mezzo soprano, Heather has performed worldwide with companies such as Opera Australia and in venues such as Carnegie Hall and St Martin-in-the-Fields. She also hosts a live-to-air performance radio series which provides opportunities for emerging classical musicians. Heather is the current president of the Australian Voice Association and a member of the Australian National Association of Teachers of Singing.

**Dr. Amanda E. Krause** is a Lecturer (Psychology) in the College of Healthcare Sciences at James Cook University (Queensland, Australia). She also currently serves as President of the Australian Music & Psychology Society. As a music psychology scholar, she studies how we experience music in our everyday lives. Her research asks how our musical experiences influence our health and well-being. Dr. Krause's research has made significant contributions to understanding how listening technologies influence people and how musical engagement impacts well-being. Recent publications and further information can be found on her website at www.researchaboutlistening.com.

Jane W. Davidson is Professor of Creative and Performing Arts, Chair of the Creativity and Wellbeing Hallmark Initiative, and Coordinator of

Opera at The University of Melbourne. There she runs the Master of Music (Opera Performance) course, where she directs many operas and scene work. Jane is also Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities. Former leadership roles include Deputy Director of the Australian Research Council's Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, President of the Australian Music and Psychology Society, and President of the Musicological Society of Australia. She has a long track record as a researcher, writer, editor, and voice practitioner, having published extensively and received significant research funding internationally. In singing, Jane has performed in UK, Europe, and North America with companies as diverse as Complicité and Opera North. She is a current member of the Australian National Association of Teachers of Singing where she has presented as a keynote speaker.

I heard a thousand blended notes, While in a grove I sate reclined, In that sweet mood when pleasant thoughts Bring sad thoughts to the mind.

To her fair works did Nature link The human soul that through me ran; And much it grieved my heart to think What man has made of man.

Through primrose tufts, in that green bower, The periwinkle trailed its wreaths; And 'tis my faith that every flower Enjoys the air it breathes.

The birds around me hopped and played, Their thoughts I cannot measure— But the least motion which they made It seemed a thrill of pleasure.

The budding twigs spread out their fan, To catch the breezy air; And I must think, do all I can, That there was pleasure there.

If this belief from heaven be sent, If such be Nature's holy plan, Have I not reason to lament What man has made of man?

> William Wordsworth, "Lines Written in Early Spring"