On Migration, Exile, and Cosmopolitanism: A Brief Survey of South African Art Song

Nico de Villiers

Nico de Villiers

One of the genres that comprise the different musics of South Africa is that of the art song. Imported through its European heritage, the art song has found a place in the portfolios of South African composers throughout the twentieth century. However, against the backdrop of its complicated history, South Africa's art songs often seem to reflect themes of exile, inner struggle and nostalgia. This article contemplates how these themes resonate through South Africa's complex history, and how they have subsequently been reflected in the genre of art song, with specific reference to songs by composers S. le Roux Marais, Hubert du Plessis, Arnold van Wyk, Peter Klatzow, Hendrik Hofmeyr, and Bongani Ndodana-Breen.

> Things that go unnamed, wander through the world, not knowing where to look, or where to go. — Lebogang Mashile

The arts have always been a way for societies to narrate their histories, comment on their present, and philosophize about their futures. They create a meeting place for disparate cultures within a society, a place to understand similarities and consider differences, and a means through which these cultures can integrate and write their assimilated narrative. South Africa's musical heritage covers a large spectrum of genres of both indigenous and adopted musics, and studies investigating music in this country inevitably include discussions of music's relation to the country's complex political history. While it is essential to recognize that history, especially in relation to the arts, I will consider the trajectory of a specific musical genre across twentieth and early twenty-first century South African history.

As an adopted genre from Europe, the art song, by its import, can be considered a displaced genre in South Africa. By investigating the genre's development in South Africa from the establishment of the Union of South Africa in 1910 through its status during the apartheid regime from 1948–1994, and its subsequent place in the musical landscape of post-apartheid South Africa, this survey will explore how issues of nostalgia, displacement, and exile often permeate the genre throughout these three periods.[1] Through its search for an identity within the South African sphere, the art song genre actually loses its Eurocentrism and its association with European "otherness" so that by the twenty-first century it can no longer be termed a displaced genre.

Journal of Singing, November/December 2023
Volume 80, No. 2, pp. 145–156
https://doi.org/10.53830/SRRI3101

LANGUAGE AND THE SOUTH AFRICAN ART SONG

Art song is understood to be an original composition for solo voice and piano, comprising an original musical setting of an original text that has been written down and is usually performed in an intimate concert setting. As such, art song stands in contrast both to traditional song that has been passed down orally from one generation to another (and generally shared within a domestic or ritualistic environment), or to popular song that is largely experienced through recordings or large scale performances in sports arenas. South African art song is considered to be original song settings in Afrikaans, English or any of the country's eleven official languages, composed by South African composers, written either in South Africa or abroad, and which adhere to the conventional voice-and-piano combination. These songs particularly incorporate elements, textually or musically, that narrate the individual narrator's South African experience. This essay explores the evolution of the South African art song genre by gauging its development against the backdrop of twentieth-century South African history and by contemplating the way certain recurring themes, through the chosen poetry, convey concepts surrounding belonging.

The art song genre's development in South Africa is inextricably linked to the evolution of poetry in Afrikaans, a modern minority language that was established as an official language in South Africa in 1925. Due to Afrikaans's recent development, the South African art song's evolution is truly a twentieth century phenomenon. In the early decades of the twentieth century, Afrikaans poetry maintained a proclivity for the European Romantic tradition but then came into its own during the 1930s. As observed by poet D. J. Opperman, Afrikaans could be furthered through musical settings and "many poems by the so-called *Dertigers* (poets of the thirties) were specifically written for being set to music."[2] The South African art song has become recognized as a genre in its own right and as "a *tour de force* in the promotion of the Afrikaans language, comparable to how the Romantic German *Lied* served the German language."[3] Due to the language's role of authority borne from its central place in South Africa's political history, Afrikaans dominates the genre. Nevertheless, while the genre is traditionally associated with Afrikaans, English texts do appear in South African art song throughout the twentieth century.[4] For instance, composer Rosa Nepgen (1909–2000) preferred setting English texts early on in her career. After discovering the Afrikaans poetry of W.E.G. Louw (the poet she would later marry), Nepgen was inspired to exclusively set Afrikaans texts for the rest of her life.[5] While Afrikaans texts, or Afrikaans translations of original European poetry, were chosen intentionally to further Afrikaans culture, languages such as Dutch, German, and French sporadically find their way into the oeuvres of South African composers Hubert du Plessis (1922–2011) and Arnold van Wyk (1916–1983).

Although occurring earlier in the century amidst Afrikaans's prominence in the genre, English song settings increased from the 1960s onwards, with John Joubert (1927–2019), Peter Klatzow (1945–2021) and Hendrik Hofmeyr (1957–) providing important examples. Joubert, based in the United Kingdom for the majority of his life, solely set English texts. Klatzow's extensive, albeit neglected, output for voice and piano is mostly in English, with early settings of Afrikaans texts being the exception in his oeuvre. Hofmeyr's song output consists of an equal balance between Afrikaans and English, with several sets of songs in Italian that were a result of his decade-long self-imposed exile in Italy.

Only in the 1990s did other South African languages start to appear in art song. In the song triptych *The Year of the Famine* (1998), Bongani Ndodana-Breen (1975–) sets his own text, fleetingly combining phrases in both English and Zulu. In the years immediately following the end of apartheid in 1994, there were conscious attempts for reconciliation through music across the previously established racial and subsequent cultural divides. Results of these efforts include collaborations between various musicians who transcribed songs and arranged them for voice and piano; the most prominent example is from the year 2000, when Klatzow arranged Mzilikazi Khumalo's transcriptions of Zulu songs by Princess Constance Magogo (1900–1984). Hans Roosenschoon arranged a Sotho choral piece, *Barali ba Jerusalema* (Daughters of Jerusalem, ca. 1968) by Michael Moerane (1904–1980) for tenor and piano and later for soloist and orchestra.[6] At the time of this writing, Andile Khumalo (1978–) is reworking his *Ekuboleni Kunempilo*

(In Death There is Life, 2001), originally composed for mezzo-soprano, flute and viola, for a voice-and-piano configuration.

A POLITICAL AND SOCIETAL BACKDROP

Before focusing particularly on issues of migration, exile and cosmopolitanism, and how they manifest themselves in South African art song, it is necessary to briefly contextualize the political and societal backdrop against which this genre developed. The country's colonial and segregated history brought about an inequality between White, Black and so-called "colored" people which filtered through all walks of life, including education.[7] This segregated approach extended to music education which subsequently reflected in composers' choices of genres.

During the 1960s and 1970s, education in South Africa was in turmoil due to the enforcement of learning in Afrikaans and the lack of education in students' native tongues. Part of that unrest transferred to music education. While the curriculum in public schools was heavily influenced by the Western music tradition, school music was largely irrelevant to Black and "colored" school children. Any time officially set aside for music lessons was often used for other unrelated activities.[8] Until the 1980s, more specialized training in solo instruments and voice, including composition (at least in the form of graded theory examinations and at most as a focused occupation), was generally reserved for young White musicians.[9] Conversely, instead of solo instrumental or vocal training, choral-oriented training tended to be the status quo for young Black musicians. This focus on choral music did not introduce young aspiring non-White composers to the art song genre and therefore the genre's presence in, or indeed its absence from, composers' lists of works can be considered a direct result of the segregation present in music education before the 1980s

Musicologist Izak Grové refers to song composition as "a less complicated musical activity . . . [making] songs often one of the first genres tried out by budding composers."[10] But even if art song had been a simpler compositional form for young composers such as Nepgen, Van Wyk, or Klatzow who composed their earliest songs in their late teens, art song as a possible form of musical expression might not have occurred to young Black composers of a similar age due to a lack of exposure to the genre during their early education. The experience of singing and vocal music-making within Black communities in South Africa tends to be a shared one, and choral singing features prominently. Since the music education afforded to Black students stressed choral music and withheld other supposedly more sophisticated genres such as art song, this partially explains the genre's absence from the portfolios of composers such as Joshua Mohapeloa (1908–1982), who, although from Lesotho, was trained in South Africa (or Moerane,) and whose output is rich in choral works instead. Thus, while White composers have composed a wealth of choral works too, for most of the twentieth century, art song is only present in White composers' work lists, itself a result of the traditional focus on their more specialized, if privileged, musical training. It appears this segregation only faded during the 1980s and the introduction of art song in music education thereafter perhaps influenced the development of composers such as Ndodana-Breen and Andile Khumalo whose oeuvres include the genre to some extent.

In addition to racial prejudice, gender imbalance has been, and remains, prevalent among South African composers. Although Princess Magogo's songs do not qualify under the current discussion's definition of art song since their texts and music did not stem from individual inspiration and had not been written down but transcribed and arranged later on, she still requires referencing here as one of a few female composers from South Africa. Likely a result of the traditional, even primitive, societal gender roles in South Africa present during most of the twentieth century, no prominent female composers' art songs, with the exception of Nepgen, are researched in depth.[11] According to Grové, by the end of her life, Nepgen had composed nearly a third of the South African art song canon.[12] Nevertheless, only sporadic research focuses on her song oeuvre: she is referred to by name in various articles and Johann Potgieter's doctoral thesis, written in Afrikaans, which discusses Nepgen along with Blanche Gertsman (1910–1973) but has not been translated and therefore remains closed to an international readership. Other than Chris Walton's portrait of Nepgen in *Gender and Sexuality in South African Music*, the only extended research in English considering Nepgen's song output and drawing "gender issues and Afrikaans nationalism

into a discussion," is that by Marie Rosalie Jorritsma.[13] Other South African female composers' art songs, such as those by Jeanne Zaidel-Rudolph, have been altogether overlooked. Whether this is due to their work being considered unworthy of critical investigation or whether there are no other female composers who have composed art songs remains unclear.

EXILE AND COSMOPOLITANISM: THE COLLECTIVE MEMORY OF MIGRANTS

Migration and exile are key characteristics of South African history. Well known South African poet, author and actress Lebogang Mashile explains that "[South Africa's] story ultimately is a story of movement and borders; identity, how identities move through different spaces, how borders shape and define space."[14] As a genre imported from Europe, South Africa's art song, the identity of the genre itself, and the identities of those who create in it, exemplifies Mashile's narrative of migration. Since various Europeans' relocation to South Africa since 1652, Europe's music had gradually been imported into this new place, assimilating itself inconspicuously with this country's musical heritage. By the turn of the twentieth century when the art song genre such as the German *Lied*, French *mélodie* and Italian *romanza* had flourished and its popularity as compositional medium had gone to seed in Europe, permutations of the same genre appeared in the United States of America and South Africa. In both these countries, the earliest art songs often describe the landscape as well as contemplate issues around displacement and nostalgia.

Mashile points out that "collective memory shapes the soul, the identity of a group of people, whether it is a family or whether it is a nation."[15] Along these lines, Jorritsma argues that separating "Princess Magogo and her musical ability from her Zulu heritage would be impossible."[16] According to Klatzow, "to rethink rather than to inherit is a very marked characteristic of more recent Western art."[17] Therefore, as Christine Lucia explains, although many of the songs Princess Magogo performed were not her own compositions, "to the extent that she was the last bearer of a unique body of songs [that had been transferred orally over generations, they] are all, in a sense, her own."[18] Thus, collective memory can be interpreted as tacitly acknowledged experiences of a people, displaced or not, who have amassed a shared memory through their interactions and traditions over generations. In the case of a displaced people such as the European settlers in South Africa who eventually became known as the Afrikaners, a product of their collective memory could be their tendency to nostalgically refer to aspects of their heritage in their folklore and literature, which in the process of their migration, were lost.

Stephanie Vos argues that as a paradigm in modern culture expression, displacement "frames discussions of all instances of music that can be considered 'other' or 'outside'; conditions especially pertinent in South Africa and indeed of any notion of crossing cultural boundaries—real or imagined."[19] Therefore, the traditions of art song and its European heritage are arguably present in the creative collective memory of the genre's composers, some of whom, by the early twentieth century, had been based in South Africa for generations.

The undercurrent of the Afrikaners' sense of non-belonging and subsequent goals to attain belonging through nationalist idealism are reactions to a chain of events—Mashile calls these signifiers—that punctuate the history of westernized South Africa.[20] Following the Dutch settlement in the Cape in 1652, this litany of signifiers include: the French Huguenots' exile from Europe and their arrival in the Cape in the late seventeenth century; the *Voortrekkers*'[21] urge to migrate inland from the Cape and subsequently the necessity to defend their appropriated land against indigenous tribes; the advancement of British imperialism during the nineteenth century, and the ensuing South African War of 1899–1902 which the British won. These early signifiers contribute to the Afrikaners' quest to counter their displacement—a pursuit they seemingly achieved when Queen Elizabeth II ceased to be head of state in 1961 and South Africa was declared a republic. Thus, ironically it was the Afrikaners' migration that signifies their gradual loss of "exile" and their progressive attainment of "belonging."

The migration of people and the resultant malleability of identity through changing spaces creates a friction within the overall sense of a people's notion of belonging, making migration the instigator of exile and cosmopolitanism its consequence. Although aimed at the Afrikaners' establishing a nationalist identity in reaction to the series of hindering signifiers up to the establish-

ment of the Union of South Africa in 1910, the merging of European heritage with African settlement over centuries inspires a sense of cosmopolitanism. Similar to citizenship not securing a sense of belonging, cosmopolitanism, however open-minded and inviting it might seem, neither guarantees it, nor removes a possible sense of displacement and exile for those who experience it. In the Afrikaners' aim to establish a sense of belonging as a non-British White community, their collective memory became an instigator towards developing sentiments of nationalism. This, according to Annemie Stimie, results in a "palpable tension between 'local' and 'global' [that] diminishes the divide [between nationalism and cosmopolitanism, causing] the interrelationship between the two notions [to be] more complex."[22]

This "palpable tension" emerges in South African art songs from the early 1900s, whereby their composers were not overtly harking back to a European heritage. Instead of setting European texts in their original languages, composers established themselves within the South African milieu: they set Afrikaans translations of texts by Goethe, Heine, Eichendorff, Rückert, Hugo, and later, by the century's third decade, focused on setting original Afrikaans poetry.[23] Overt cosmopolitanism seems to reveal itself only in mid-century composers like Du Plessis and Van Wyk, who, due to their studies in and their association with the United Kingdom, exhibit Stimie's "palpable tension between 'local' and 'global.'" Du Plessis's and Van Wyk's study abroad set a precedent for embracing cosmopolitanism among South African composers: many followed their examples to study in Europe and the United States, and some ended up settling abroad permanently.

"HEIMWEE" AS A PORTRAIT OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN LANDSCAPE

Although composers focused on setting Afrikaans texts in the twentieth century, the genre maintained great similarity to the German *Lied*. In its original guise, *Lieder* maintained prevalent themes describing nature, often expressing yearning and nostalgia, and frequently contemplating issues of displacement and the search for a sense of belonging. The themes that migrated into the South African counterpart still include descriptions of nature and express concerns specific to issues of belonging. By the late-1900s, the themes developed to commenting, deliberately or inadvertently, on the political situation at the time.[24]

"Heimwee" (Longing, 1929), a setting by S. le Roux Marais (1896–1979) of a text by J. R. L. van Bruggen, is arguably closer to a folk song than an art song and contributes to "the imagining of a partially White South African consciousness as European."[25] Van Bruggen apparently wrote the text while studying in the Netherlands. The text describes the longing for a quiet, expansive African landscape to contrast the hustle and bustle of the people and noisiness of city commerce. Stephanus Muller highlights that Marais's nostalgic sound portrait "uses Van Bruggen's poem as a vehicle to directly eulogize and evoke the notion of home through rural pastoral landscape in song."[26] With near Schubertian word-painting, Marais portrays the solace of silence in a lyrical vocal line supported by rippling piano arpeggios in a major mode, contrasting the city through sudden shifts to a minor tonality. Yet the narrator's rose-tinted "notion of home" in this song does not fully capture the differing experiences of the varied peoples inhabiting this place.

NARRATORS OF OTHERNESS AND EXILE

Two song cycles considered beacons in the Afrikaans art song genre are Hubert du Plessis's *Vreemde Liefde* (Strange Love, 1952) and Arnold van Wyk's *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid* (On Love and Desolation, 1956). Both cycles expose the human circumstance of otherness and the personal experience of exile even when not politically motivated.

For *Vreemde Liefde*, a commission by the Van Riebeeck Festival of 1952 commemorating the Dutch settling in South Africa in 1652, Hubert du Plessis chose eight poems from I. D. du Plessis's collection with the same name.[27] The title inherently suggests otherness by naming the love "peculiar." Here, otherness in I.D. du Plessis's verse is homosexuality, an issue so contentious that critics in the 1950s never directly referred to the poetry's homoerotic overtones. According to Heinrich van der Mescht, critics instead used phrases such as "struggle without victory," "sin" and "weakness" to reference this peculiar love.[28] He suggests that otherness in Du Plessis's song cycle, considered within a mid-century

South African context, has at least two perspectives; either reflecting the poet's original homoerotic slant or referencing an interracial relationship.[29] In 1950s South Africa, both a homosexual or interracial relationship would not only have been "strange" but illegal. Thus, sheltered by the ambiguity portrayed in the text, Du Plessis perhaps felt confident to set these texts.

Du Plessis started composing *Vreemde Liefde* in South Africa and completed it in London while studying at the Royal Academy of Music. As far as his sexuality was concerned, Du Plessis felt culturally displaced. He never hid his sexual orientation in South Africa, explaining "I never hid it but neither did I make a lot of noise about it. I just wanted to be myself."[30] But the critical attitude towards homosexuality in England made him draw parallels with the communist witch hunts of the 1950s radical Joseph McCarthy in the United States.[31] While Du Plessis's boldness to set texts with clear homosexual references is an example of him unapologetically being himself, the situation in England triggered for him the isolation often experienced by LGBTQ+ individuals as a result of prejudice within a conservative milieu.[32]

While Du Plessis's cycle confronts sexuality covertly, describing (to echo Paul Verlaine), the "chosen landscape" of a man's body, Van Wyk's *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid* narrates experiences of isolation and exile more transparently through settings of Eugène Marais's poetry. It presents the African landscape and comments on the experiences of the people who inhabit it, even if at times prejudicially. The cycle ranges from descriptions of atmosphere and landscape through tone painting to highlighting human conditions within exile while attempting to musically harness African-ness. The primary underlying factor throughout this cycle is melancholy. Magdalena Oosthuizen writes that in "Die Towenares" (The Witch) and "Woestyn-Lewerkie" (Desert Lark) Van Wyk uses large intervals in the voice to suggest longing, and falling thirds, melancholy. In the piano, chromaticism and tone rows shaped in circular melodies express gloomy isolation.[33] Earlier scholarship suggests that Van Wyk conjures up "direct primitivism" in the modality of the circular tone rows[34] and Africanness through "stylistically convincing" rhythms.[35] Matildie Wium counters that, in the absence of ethnomusicological support for these claims, Van Wyk's writing is "little more than a gesture toward *couleur locale*."[36]

The central song of *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid* is "Winternag" (Winters Night). The poem is a classic in Afrikaans literature and its regular rhythm lends itself to musical interpretation. With settings by Marais, du Plessis, Nepgen, Klatzow and Hofmeyr, "Winternag" is arguably the one poem from Afrikaans literature which has been set to music most often.[37] Van Wyk depicts the bleak winter landscape by writing the piano part mainly in the high register with delicately quivering trills and drawn-through parallel octaves, blemished with slight dissonances through added seconds. Undertones of longing and desolation emerge throughout the text and the vocal line atmospherically depicts the bare landscape through extended silences during the piano interludes.[38]

"Winternag" is the only song in the cycle that features no people. The absence of the inhabitants from the other songs accentuate the "existential tragedy of a state of alienation."[39] The otherwise self-reflecting singer is exiled to the observing third person narrative perspective and becomes a contrapuntal obbligato to the substantial piano part. Edward Said draws a parallel between exile and counterpoint, stating "Most people are principally aware of one culture, one setting, one home; exiles are aware of at least two, and this plurality of vision gives rise to an awareness of simultaneous dimensions, an awareness that—to borrow a phrase from music—is contrapuntal."[40] Van Wyk privately admitted to feeling "uprooted and strange" when he left England and returned to South Africa. He acquired a cosmopolitan outlook during his time in London and, "having experienced World War II at closer range than most of his compatriots," mistrusted Afrikaner nationalism.[41] The exile portrayed in "Winternag" reflects that uprootedness Van Wyk experienced and arguably portrays his own disjointed sense of belonging by always deferring "to the place where he was not."[42] *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid* elevated the status of the South African art song internationally and *The Scotsman*'s Michael Rayment described the cycle as "one of the most important contributions of our time to the literature of song."[43]

TOWARDS A COMMON LANGUAGE OF CULTURE

As the Van Riebeeck festival of 1952 was a reflective marker on the cultural timeline of South Africa, the

Standard Bank National Arts Festival of 1992 was an anticipatory point on that same timeline. It signaled the imminent sea change of the cultural landscape that would follow the crumbling of apartheid and the founding of a democratic South Africa in 1994. The country was in the middle of a four-year period towards that drastic change when Peter Klatzow composed *Songs of Exile*. The cycle, commissioned by the National Arts Festival, is settings of seven poems from activist Dennis Brutus's collection *A Simple Lust*. These poems allude to Brutus's incarceration on Robben Island[44] and references the inmates left behind after his release.[45]

All the texts in Klatzow's cycle were taken from the group "After Exile" in Brutus's collection. Said explains that the scars of exile remain a part of a person's consciousness, that "[exile's] essential sadness can never be surmounted."[46] The insurmountable sadness in Brutus's post-exile state betrays a survivor guilt that permeates throughout the poems. The piano introduction of the opening song "In the dove-grey, dove-soft dusk," is built around a triplet-figure that at first seems to be but a passing melodic motif. As the song develops, the island is depicted by a spacious chordal accompaniment while the vocal line embodies the gradual manifestation of the landscape: short phrases over "the island breathed/ trees, grass, stones, and sand breathed" progressively grow longer and more drawn out. Above the vocal line, Klatzow shapes a wispily flute-like countermelody underpinned by chordal accompaniment. At the mention of "the sea was a soft circling presence/ no longer a tight barbed menacing ring" a fine countermelody evolves into a "soft circling" undulating accompaniment. This serenity is interrupted by the recurrence of the introduction's triplet motif, now weighted down by accents in response to the "barbed menacing ring," presumably referencing the barbed wire around the prison. Later, when rich and gentle chords softly pulsate at the mention of the "simple desire to stroll in the quiet dusk/ as I do now," the narrator's survivor's guilt as a result of his freedom is highlighted when the piano abruptly stops at the words "and they do not." The song unravels with sighing iterations of the triplet motif from the introduction.

Klatzow handles other instances of post-exile guilt by interrupting the piano part with silence while the voice continues. At times, this musically creates a fractured atmosphere, especially in the song "I am the tree," where the vocal and piano lines never sound together. Visually, the musical score portrays this displacement: whenever the voice sounds, the piano stave is absent and vice versa, leaving various blank spaces across the page. The musical effect seems to portray the unsettled freedom often experienced post exile. Said explains that, following exile, an "unsealable rift [is] forced between a human being and a native place, between the self and its true home."[47] This sentiment climaxes in the final song, "And I am driftwood." As an exclamation of non-belonging, the song's scope is epic. In bars, it is nearly as long as the other six songs combined, and this seeming imbalance is deliberate. The song depicts the liberated exile's perpetual search for belonging.

Hendrik Hofmeyr set six S. V. Petersen poems in *Alleenstryd* (A Struggle Alone), a commission from the South African Rights Music Organisations (SAMRO) in 1996 for a series of masterclasses by internationally acclaimed South African tenor Deon van der Walt that same year. SAMRO initially expected Hofmeyr to set some "struggle" poems, or texts concerning South Africa's freedom fighters, but Hofmeyr is against mobilizing his music for any political means. He is outspoken over what he views as the tendency in the arts to create so-called politically relevant art and finds this approach superficial.[48]

Petersen's poetry generally expresses his experience as an outsider—as a so-called coloured writer within a White literary community, as well as a literary figure in his own community. Hofmeyr identified with Petersen's text as he found himself to be fighting a lone battle as an outsider, too.[49]

> I think the poems speak in a universal way to the oppressed and marginalized in all walks of life. Not only did I identify strongly with what Petersen must have suffered, but I could also apply it to my own position, both as a homosexual in a society, which, at the time when I grew up, was much less accepting than it is now of homosexuality, and as an 'outsider' (both in Italy and in SA) in the very cliquey, politicised and fashion-obsessed world of composition.[50]

Hofmeyr's composition in general tends to create "hidden expressions and complex musical material" which therefore made setting Petersen's "simple and direct" text a challenge.[51] However, Hilde Roos asserts

that the text, although written in straightforward language, is charged with intensity and expression, therefore matching Hofmeyr's stylistic romanticism which embraces subjective emotion and passion while striving for the transcendental and the ideal.[52]

In *Alleenstryd*, Hofmeyr tried for the first time to create an integrated cycle where all songs are interdependent and each contains corresponding central thematic material.[53] Conroy Cupido observes that the thematic arc throughout the cycle progresses from isolation and despair to eventual triumph.[54] A sense of isolation is established in the first song, "Kinders van Kain" (Children of Cain); the title alone suggests otherness and banishment, echoing the burden of paying for the "sins of the father," thus indirectly the collective memory of a people. Petersen's words reference the institutionalized racism which was borne by the infants on the wrong side of apartheid South Africa's colour line. Here Hofmeyr presents his canvas of symbolist concepts that will prevail throughout the cycle. They portray innocence through the use of the pentatonic scale, the purity of the octatonic scale subtly clouded with semitones, and momentous chiaroscuric shifts between tonalities that represent "man's fall from grace."[55]

The cycle consistently juxtaposes opposites, "drifting between innocence and corruption . . ."[56] This friction is drawn into focus in the fourth song, "Kinderland" (Land of Childhood) when the vocal line is echoed in the piano, creating a two-part canon. The canon, says Hofmeyr, is a "superimposing of past and present [which] in the canonic discourse can result in an experience of almost overwhelming intensity."[57] Being placed between two turbulent songs, "Kinderland" superficially creates a resting point within the cycle, reminiscent of a similar placement of "Winternag" in Van Wyk's *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid*. But on a deeper level, the tumultuous reality and sense of powerless rage present in those songs contrasts with the innocent nostalgia of "Kinderland" and creates a contrapuntal juxtaposition of present and past, of loss and regret.

The final song, "Ecce Homo" (Behold the Man) is a musical translation of the poet's "laborious ascent from utter despair to triumph."[58] While this triumph, exclaimed in the upper register of the voice and supported by virtuosity in the piano, only truly occurs in the last two bars of the cycle, it maintains some dissonance within the strong major harmony that echoes Said's theory of the insurmountable sadness that remains in the process of conquering adversity. Thus, compared to the closing ballad in Klatzow's *Songs of Exile* where the narrator experiences some sense of arrival (albeit uncertain of the future), in the final song of Hofmeyr's *Alleenstryd*, the outsider's pessimism and disgust with the world turns into a triumphant epiphany of potential survival. It is striking to note that both these cycles in some ways have open ended resolutions, perhaps reflective of the undercurrent of personal and political uncertainty felt by so many at the time of the cycles' composition.

SOUTH AFRICAN ART SONG IN THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

Currently, arguably the most prominent South African composer to write concert works that include the solo voice—whether in opera, oratorio, orchestral or art songs—is Bongani Ndodana-Breen. His work is taking South African vocal music beyond the country's geographical borders, both in its conception and performance. The South African narrative of race inequality and struggle of the 1990s has shifted to joining a global consideration of decolonization. Ndodana-Breen's Afrikaans triptych *Three Orchestral Songs on Poems of Ingrid Jonker* (2015) for soprano and orchestra highlights the importance of how far the country has come.

In 1998 Ndodana-Breen set three of his own poems to music, entitled *Inkomo Zifile* (The Cows are Dead) with the alternative title, *The Year of the Famine*. This short cycle's uninterrupted structure foreshadows his *Three Orchestral Songs* in that the songs are linked with extended interludes. *Inkomo Zifile* narrates an alternative, perhaps more honest, existence about the landscape longed for in Marais's "Heimwee." While "Heimwee" portrays a romanticized reference to the African landscape from an arguably Eurocentric perspective, the songs of *Inkomo Zifile* speak of the hardships of those dependent on the land for their survival. In the first song, "The Shades," large clouds cast shadows as they amass before a rain storm. These shadows become similes for the ancestors ("Speak all you from yonder") who are asked "Why do my people suffer and die in vain?" The second song, "My Father's Cattle," conveys hopelessness as the drought caused the whole herd to die and, hav-

ing lost everything, "[all] is gone along with the family name." The final song, "The Year of the Famine," is a desperate outcry asking, "Have the shades forsaken us?" echoing the already drawn parallel between natural phenomena and the spiritual world, and portrays a relationship with belief systems beyond the realm of Western religion. Overall, Ndodana-Breen's song oeuvre express a fusion of cultures. While his settings of his own as well as Ingrid Jonker's poems narrate an African experience, his settings of Japanese haikus by the ancient poet Konishi Raizan embrace cosmopolitanism beyond the eastern meridian.

CONCLUSION

As cultures mix, interact and often adopt each other's habits, so musical styles influence one another and cause music to become a mirror to a people, reflecting a myriad of tendencies drawn together in a kaleidoscopic culture. While South African art song composers mainly set Afrikaans and English texts during most of the twentieth century, composers from the latter part of the century aimed to embrace musical styles beyond European influence. Instead, they incorporate musical and textual characteristics reflective of South African cultures.

Throughout the twentieth century, questions of belonging and exile permeate the South African art song genre. It is particularly interesting to note that, while Du Plessis and Van Wyk established the genre on a broader international level than had been the case before, Klatzow and Hofmeyr forged new ways by giving voice to an alternative narrative from the other side of the apartheid racial divide.[59] By setting texts of poets such as Dennis Brutus and S. V. Petersen respectively, Klatzow and Hofmeyr took the South African art song genre beyond the one-sided perspective of the apartheid establishment.

Said wrote that "White settlers in Africa . . . may once have been exiles, but as pioneers and nation-builders, they lost the label 'exile.'"[60] Today the same could be said for art song in South Africa: over the course of the twentieth century the genre gradually shed its European guise and instead, depicted the South African landscape, narrating the experiences of those who inhabit it, and acting as a commentator on the country's political concerns. Having moved beyond the blinkered parameters of language and race in pursuit of conveying a broader insight into the South African narrative beyond the country's borders, South African composers are now endowed with a vocal genre that holds the potential of being an agent by which to preserve this country's heritage, to further express its people's experiences, and compose its next chapter through the narrative of song.

SOURCES

Cupido, Conroy. "Significant Influences in the Composition of Hendrik Hofmeyr's Song Cycle, *Alleenstryd* [Lone Struggle]." (Doctoral dissertation, University of North Texas, 2009.)

Grové, Izak. "Die motiwiese eenheid in Arnold van Wyk se liedersiklus *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid*" [The motivic unity in Arnold van Wyk's song cycle *Van Liefde en Verlatenheid*], *Acta Academica*. (1983). pp. 31–39.

Grové, Izak. "'Making the Dutchman Proud of His Language . . . ': 'n Eeu Van Die Afrikaanse Kunslied [a Century of the Afrikaans Art Song].' Tydskrif Vir Geesteswetenskappe [Journal of Humanities]." *Tydskrif Geesteswetenskappe* [*Journal of Humanities*] 51, no. 4 (December 2011): 31–39.

Jorritsma, Marie Rosalie. "South African 'Songprints': The Lives and Works of Jeanne Zaidel-Rudolph, Princess Constance Magogo, and Rosa Nepgen." (Doctoral dissertation, Rice University, 2001.)

Klatzow, Peter. "'Addenda: The Composer's Dilemma Writing for Time or Place.'" *SAMUS* 24 (2004): 135–41.

Mashile, Lebogang. *Memory Matters*, 2016. URL: https://youtu.be/RkSESEefexo; accessed 10-7-23.

May, James. "The Marriage of Instinct and Ingenuity: Canonic Writing in the Music of Hendrik Hofmeyr." *Journal of the Musical Arts in Africa* 14, no. 1–2 (2017): 15–52.

Muller, Staphanus. "Arnold Van Wyk's Hard, Stony, Flinty Path, or Making Things Beautiful in Apartheid South Africa." *The Musical Times* 149, no. 1905 (2008): 61–78.

Muller, Stephanus. "Apartheid Aesthetics and Insignificant Art: The Songs of Stephanus Le Roux Marais." *The Journal of Musicology* 33, no. 1 (2016): 45–69.

Oosthuizen, Magdalena Johanna. "Arnold Van Wyk as Liedkomponis: 'n Ontsluiting Van Die Liedere in Die Arnold Van Wyk-Versameling by Die Universiteit Stellenbosch [Arnold Van Wyk as Song Composer: Unlocking the Songs in the Arnold Van Wyk Collection at the University Stellenbosch]." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2014.)

Potgieter, Johann Hendrik. "'n Analitiese Oorsig Van Die Afrikaanse Kunslied Met Klem Op Die Werke Van Nepgen, Gerstman, Van Wyk En Du Plessis [An Analytical Overview of the

South African Art Song, Focusing on the Works of Nepgen, Gertsman, Van Wyk and Du Plessis]." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pretoria, 1967.)

Rijsdijk, Anthea Susan Chawner. "An Investigation into the State of Music Education in the Learning Areas Arts and Culture in Primary Schools of the Western Cape Metropole." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Cape Town, 2003.)

Roos, Hilde. "Hendrik Hofmeyr: Lewe En Werk 1957–1999 [Hendrik Hofmeyr: Life and Work 1957–1999]." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2000.)

Roos, Hilde. *The La Traviata Affair: Opera in the Age of Apartheid*. (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2018.)

Roosenschoon, Hans. "Keeping Our Ears to the Ground: Cross-Culturalism and the Composer in South Africa, 'Old' and 'New.'" Essay in *Composing the Music of Africa*, edited by Malcolm Flloyd (New York City, NY: Routledge, 1999), 265–90.

Said, Edward Wadie. *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*. (London: Granta, 2000).

Stimie, Annemie. "Cosmopolitanism in Early Afrikaans Music Historiography, 1910–1948." master's dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2010.

Sustar, Lee, and Aisha Karim. *Poetry & Protest: A Dennis Brutus Reader*. (Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2006.)

Thom Wium, Matildie. "'Hubert Du Plessis (1922–2011): An Appreciation.'" *Musicus* 39, no. 2 (2011).

Van der Mescht, Heinrich. "Die Agtergrond En Ontstaansgeskiedenis Van Hubert Du Plessis Se Duitse En Franse Liedere [The Background and Genesis of Hubert Du Plessis's German and French Songs]." *Literator: Journal of Literary Criticism, comparative linguistics and literary studies* 24, no. 2 (2003).

Van der Mescht, Heinrich. "Navorsingsartikels: Hendrik Hofmeyr Se Afrikaanse Kunsliedere ['Research Articles: Hendrik Hofmeyr's Afrikaans Art Songs]." *Musicus* 32, no. 5 (2007): 46–56.

Van Rhyn, Chris. "Towards a Mapping of the Marginal Readings of Art Songs by Nigerian, Ghanaian, Egyptian and South African Composers." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2013.)

Vos, Stephanie. "Exploring Displacement as a Theoretical Paradigm for Understanding John Joubert's Opera *Silas Marner*," (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2009.)

Walton, Chris. "Being Rosa." Essay. In *Gender and Sexuality in South African Music*, edited by Stephanus Muller and Chris Walton. Stellenbosch, South Africa: SUN, 2005.

Wium, Matildie. "Arnold Van Wyk's *Van Liefde En Verlatenheid*." Essay. In *Twentieth- and Twenty-First-Century Song Cycles*, edited by Gordon Sly and Michael Callahan. (Milton Park, Abingdon-upon-Thames, England: Routledge, 2020.)

NOTES

1. While this article is intended to open up a conversation around these particular themes present in the South African art song genre, the list of composers included here is by no means exhaustive.
2. Chris Van Rhyn, "Towards a Mapping of the Marginal Readings of Art Songs by Nigerian, Ghanaian, Egyptian and South African Composers." (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2013), 139.
3. Ibid, 141.
4. Ibid,139.
5. Marie Rosalie Jorritsma, "South African 'Songprints': The Lives and Works of Jeanne Zaidel-Rudolph, Princess Constance Magogo, and Rosa Nepgen" (Doctoral dissertation, Rice University, 2001), 87, 90.
6. Van Rhyn, "Towards a Mapping of the Marginal Readings of Art Songs,"142.
7. According to Hilde Roos, the term "*Coloured* in South Africa includes mixed race but goes beyond this notion and refers to a conglomerate of diverse peoples and identities that were artificially grouped together during apartheid because they did not fit into easily identifiably racial categories such as "white" and "black." People who are referred to as coloured therefore share some political experiences, but to this day, *coloured* is marked by a heterogeneity of ethnicities, histories, and identities. . . . In some activist and post-apartheid circles, preference is given to the phrase 'so-called coloured,' highlighting the term as an apartheid construct. Yet many South Africans who self-identify as coloureds take offence at being referred to as 'so-called.'" Hilde Roos, *The La Traviata Affair: Opera in the Age of Apartheid* (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2018): xiii.
8. Anthea Susan Chawner Rijsdijk, "'An Investigation into the State of Music Education in the Learning Areas Arts and Culture in Primary Schools of the Western Cape Metropole.'" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Cape Town, 2003), 37.
9. Ibid, 24–25.
10. Izak Grové, "'Making the Dutchman Proud of His Language . . . ': 'n Eeu Van Die Afrikaanse Kunslied [a Century of the Afrikaans Art Song].' Tydskrif Vir Geesteswetenskappe [Journal of Humanities]," *Tydskrif Geesteswetenskappe [Journal of Humanities]* 51, no. 4 (December 2011): 670.
11. Walton concedes that "To suggest that her music's subordination to the text is a reflection of the gender-based hierarchies in her marriage, in which her husband was not just that famous creative artist but also the bread-winner, might seem overly simplistic but is probably not far from the truth." Chris Walton, "Being Rosa," in *Gender and Sexual-*

ity in South African Music, ed. Stephanus Muller and Chris Walton (Stellenbosch, South Africa: SUN, 2005), 67.

12. Grové, "'Making the Dutchman Proud of His Language": 670.
13. Van Rhyn "Towards a Mapping of the Marginal Readings of Art Songs," 10.
14. Lebogang Mashile, *Memory Matters*, *Memory Matters*, 2016, https://youtu.be/RkSESEefexo.
15. Ibid.
16. Marie Rosalie Jorritsma, "South African 'Songprints': The Lives and Works of Jeanne Zaidel-Rudolph, Princess Constance Magogo, and Rosa Nepgen" (Doctoral dissertation, Rice University, 2001), 45.
17. Peter Klatzow, "'Addenda: The Composer's Dilemma Writing for Time or Place,'" *SAMUS South African Journal of Musicology* 24, no. 1 (2004): 136.
18. Jorritsma, "South African 'Songprints' ", 61.
19. Stephanie Vos, "Exploring Displacement as a Theoretical Paradigm for Understanding John Joubert's Opera *Silas Marner*" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2009), 5.
20. Lebogang Mashile, *Memory Matters*, *Memory Matters*, 2016, https://youtu.be/RkSESEefexo.
21. Dutch-speaking migrants whose descendants would also become known as Afrikaners.
22. Annemie Stimie, "Cosmopolitanism in Early Afrikaans Music Historiography, 1910–1948" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2010), 23.
23. Van Rhyn, "Towards a Mapping of the Marginal Readings of Art Songs," 141.
24. It is interesting to note that art songs written in Afrikaans are sometimes, mostly within academia, still referred to by the German term "Lied" (singular) and "Lieder" (plural) as opposed to its Afrikaans translations of "lied" (singular) and "liedere" (plural). This is perhaps a way in which to distinguish these songs from popular or folk songs ("liedjies" or "volksliedjies") and is arguably an example of how, at least in academic parlance, the users of these terms are trying to hold on to the genre's roots and perceived elevated status.
25. Stephanus Muller, "Apartheid Aesthetics and Insignificant Art: The Songs of Stephanus Le Roux Marais," *The Journal of Musicology* 33, no. 1 (2016): 49.
26. Ibid: 60–61.
27. Since the composer and poet share their last names, subsequent references to the poet always include his initials for clarity. References to the composer are by his surname alone.
28. Heinrich van der Mescht, "Die Agtergrond En Ontstaansgeskiedenis Van Hubert Du Plessis Se Duitse En Franse Liedere" [The Background and Genesis of Hubert Du Plessis's German and French Songs] *Literator: Journal of Literary Criticism, Comparative Linguistics and Literary Studies* 24, no. 2 (2003): 161.
29. Ibid: 164.
30. Ibid: 158.
31. Ibid: 164, n16.
32. Ibid: 164.
33. Magdalena Johanna Oosthuizen, "Arnold Van Wyk as Liedkomponis: 'n Ontsluiting Van Die Liedere in Die Arnold Van Wyk-Versameling by Die Universiteit Stellenbosch" [Arnold Van Wyk as Song Composer: Unlocking the Songs in the Arnold Van Wyk Collection at the University Stellenbosch] (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2014), 229–230.
34. Izak Grové, "Die Motiwiese Eenheid in Arnold Van Wyk Se Liedersiklus *Van Liefde En Verlatenheid*" [The Motivic Unity in Arnold Van Wyk's Song Cycle *Van Liefde En Verlatenheid*], *Acta Academia* (1983), 37.
35. Johann Hendrik Potgieter, "'n Analitiese Oorsig Van Die Afrikaanse Kunslied Met Klem Op Die Werke Van Nepgen, Gerstman, Van Wyk En Du Plessis [An Analytical Overview of the South African Art Song Focusing on the Works of Nepgen, Gertsman, Van Wyk and Du Plessis]" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pretoria, 1967), 471.
36. Matildie Wium, "Arnold Van Wyk's Van Liefde En Verlatenheid," in *Twentieth- and Twenty-First-Century Song Cycles*, ed. Gordon Sly and Michael Callahan (Milton Park, Abingdon-upon-Thames, England: Routledge, 2020), 69.
37. Oosthuizen, "Arnold Van Wyk as Song Composer," 254.
38. Ibid, 256.
39. Although they share a name, Nampti is the name of two different girls occurring in the cycle. See Matildie Wium, "Arnold Van Wyk's," in *Twentieth- and Twenty-First-Century Song Cycles*, ed. Gordon Sly and Michael Callahan (Milton Park, Abingdon-upon-Thames, England: Routledge, 2020): 69–70.
40. Edward W. Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays* (London: Granta, 2000): 186.
41. Matildie Wium, "Arnold Van Wyk's *Van Liefde En Verlatenheid*," in *Twentieth- and Twenty-First-Century Song Cycles*, ed. Gordon Sly and Michael Callahan (Milton Park, Abingdon-upon-Thames, England: Routledge, 2020): 66.
42. Staphanus Muller, "Arnold Van Wyk's Hard, Stony, Flinty Path, or Making Things Beautiful in Apartheid South Africa," *The Musical Times* 149, no. 1905 (2008): 70.
43. Magdalena Johanna Oosthuizen, "Arnold Van Wyk as Liedkomponis: 'n Ontsluiting Van Die Liedere in Die Arnold Van

Wyk-Versameling by Die Universiteit Stellenbosch [Arnold Van Wyk as Song Composer: Unlocking the Songs in the Arnold Van Wyk Collection at the University Stellenbosch]" (Doctoral dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2014): 311.

44. An island in Table Bay off the coast of South Africa which, since the eighteenth century has been a prison. From 1961 it was a maximum security prison, generally used for the incarceration of political prisoners, with Nelson Mandela likely its most renowned inmate. Brutus's brother was also imprisoned on Robben Island and later died in exile.
45. Lee Sustar and Aisha Karim, *Poetry & Protest: A Dennis Brutus Reader* (Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2006): 414.
46. Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*), 173.
47. Ibid.
48. Hilde Roos, "Hendrik Hofmeyr: Lewe En Werk 1957–1999" [Hendrik Hofmeyr: Life and Work 1957–1999] (dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, 2000): 38.
49. Ibid: 64–65.
50. Hendrik Hofmeyr, as quoted in Conroy Cupido, "Significant Influences in the Composition of Hendrik Hofmeyr's Song Cycle, Alleenstryd" (dissertation, University of North Texas, 2009), 21.
51. Roos, "Hendrik Hofmeyr: Lewe En Werk," 65.
52. Ibid, 24, 26.
53. Heinrich van der Mescht, "Navorsingsartikels: Hendrik Hofmeyr Se Afrikaanse Kunsliedere" [Research Articles: Hendrik Hofmeyr's Afrikaans Art Songs], *Musicus* 32, no. 5 (2007): 51.
54. Cupido, "Significant Influences in the Composition of Hendrik Hofmeyr's Song Cycle, I" (Doctoral dissertation, University of North Texas, 2009): 20.
55. Ibid: 26.
56. Ibid: 28.
57. James May, "'The Marriage of Instinct and Ingenuity: Canonic Writing in the Music of Hendrik Hofmeyr.,'" *Journal of the Musical Arts in Africa* 14, no. 1–2 (2017): 17.
58. Conroy Cupido, "Significant Influences in the Composition of Hendrik Hofmeyr's Song Cycle, Alleenstryd, 39.
59. Hans Roosenschoon, "Keeping Our Ears to the Ground: Cross-Culturalism and the Composer in South Africa, 'Old' and 'New,'" in *Composing the Music of Africa*, ed. Malcolm Flloyd (New York City, NY: Routledge, 1999): 268.
60. Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays,* 181.

South African-born collaborative pianist **Nico de Villiers** focuses his research on themes of identity and migration in art song. He holds degrees from the Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama in Glasgow, the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, USA, and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama (GSMD) in London. He performs internationally with appearances including the Royal Festival Hall in London, the Salzburg Mozarteum, and the Bonn Kammermusiksaal.

He gained his PhD in Music from the GSMD in 2018, for his practice-based research entitled *The Becoming of a Song Composer: A critical re-evaluation of Richard Hageman and His Songs*. He subsequently co-authored the first critical biography of Richard Hageman (1881–1966), entitled *Richard Hageman: From Holland to Hollywood* (Peter Lang, 2020) and recorded the first album solely dedicated to Hageman's songs *Voices: Songs by Richard Hageman* with Australian soprano Siobhan Stagg (ALIUD, 2022). His articles on art song and opera have been published in *Classical Singer*, *Opera*, *Pianist Magazine*, and *VoicePrints*, the journal for the New York Singing Teachers Association. Dr. De Villiers is the Deputy Head of Vocal Studies at the Royal Northern College of Music in Manchester, England.